

Comparability of paper and computerized non-cognitive measures:

A review and integration



Alan D. Mead
American Institute of Certified Public Accountants
David L. Blitz
Chicago School of Professional Psychology and Illinois
Institute of Technology



Comparability is...

- Different versions (paper- and computer-based) produce the same scores
 - Same rank order of test-takers
 - Same mean and standard deviation
 - Same correlation with other variables



Comparability Studies

- Between Subjects
 - ANOVA/ANCOVA/etc.
 - DIF
 - SEM
- Within-Subjects
 - Correlation
 - Paired t-test



Between Ss designs

- ANOVA/ANCOVA/etc.
 - Tests difference in means, not rank-order
 - Beware that standard statistical tests are of limited value... comparability=accepting the null
 - Readily meta-analyzable



Between Ss designs

- Differential Item Functioning (DIF)
 - Tests difference in item means but not rank-order nor group differences
 - Probably more powerful than ANOVA
 - Again, standard statistical tests are of limited value
 - Cannot be cumulated using meta-analysis



Between Ss designs

- Structural Equations Modeling (SEM)
 - Tests equality of correlations
 - Also, tests difference in item and/or scale means but not rank-order
 - Probably more powerful than ANOVA
 - Standard statistical tests do not directly test equivalence (you accept the null)
 - Cannot be cumulated using meta-analysis



Within Ss designs

- Correlation
 - Directly tests rank orders, but does not test means
 - Common statistical tests not valuable
 - Readily meta-analyzable
- Paired t-test/repeated measures
 - Test means, more powerful than ANOVA



Ideal study

- Large Within-Ss sample
 - Assess correlation
 - Use equivalence testing (Rogers, et al., 1993) to assess means
 - Use SEM to analyze covariance
- Also, include covariates
 - Include measures that might explain non-comparability



Meta-analysis

- Found 105 studies comparing non-cognitive paper- and computer-based versions
 - Only 6 studies were appropriate
 - within-Ss, noncognitive measures, with reliabilities
 - N=760, 41 correlations
 - Weighted average cross-mode correlation=1.02